Participatory classification: Evolution and opportunities

David M. Pimentel
Syracuse University School of Information Studies
Definitions

- Classification: setting entities in meaningful relation to one another (cf. Sayers, 1944)

- Participatory classification: open-ended process allowing multiple people to collaborate on shared classifications, including creation and ongoing modification
Study

- Examine the evolution of participatory classifications in the English-language Wikipedia

- Unobtrusive sources of evidence:
  - community documentation
  - archives of edit histories
Religion

From Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia

"Religious" redirects here. For a member of a religious community, see Religious order.
For other uses, see Religion (disambiguation).

A religion is a set of tenets and practices, often centered upon specific supernatural and moral claims about reality, the cosmos, and human nature, and often codified as prayer, ritual, or religious law. Religion also encompasses ancestral or cultural traditions, writings, history, and mythology, as well as personal faith and religious experience. The term "religion" refers to both the personal practices related to communal faith and to group rituals and communication stemming from shared conviction.

In the frame of western religious thought, they present a common quality, the "hallmark of patriarchal religious thought": the division of the world in two comprehensive domains, one sacred, the other profane. Religion is often described as a communal system for the coherence of belief focusing on a system of thought, unseen being, person, or object, that is considered to be supernatural, sacred, divine, or of the highest truth. Moral codes, practices, values, institutions, tradition, rituals, and scriptures are often traditionally associated with the core belief, and these may have some overlap with concepts in secular philosophy. Religion is also often described as a "way of life" or a life stance.

The development of religion has taken many forms in various cultures. "Organized religion"
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Religion topics</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Major groups</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abrahamic</td>
<td>Bahá'í Faith, Christianity, Gnosticism, Islam, Judaism, Rastafari, Samaritanism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>Ayyavazhi, Buddhism, Hinduism, Jainism, Sikhism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iranian</td>
<td>Manichaeanism, Mazdakism, Yarsan, Yazidi, Zoroastrianism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Asian</td>
<td>Chinese, Confucianism, Juche, Taoism, Shinto</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern</td>
<td>Caïn Dai, I-Kuan Tao, Neopaganism, Scientology, Spiritism, Tenrikyo, Unitarian Universalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic / Folk</td>
<td>African, Afro-American, Eurasian, Indigenous Australian, Native American, Pacific, Polynesian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ancient religions</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prehistoric</td>
<td>Egyptian, Semitic, Mesopotamian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Near East</td>
<td>Celtic, Germanic, Illyro-thracian, Greek, Hellenism (Gnosticism, Neoplatonism), Roman, Slavic, Vedic Hinduism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indo-European</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Aspects</strong></td>
<td>Apostasy / Disaffiliation, Beliefs, Conversion, Denomination, Deities, God, Meditation, Monasticism, Mysticism, Orthodoxy, Orthopraxy, Mythology, Priesthood, Ritual (liturgy, sacrifice), Spirituality, Supernatural, Symbols, Truth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Religious studies</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anthropology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparison</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Origin</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philosophy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sociology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theories</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timeline</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Politics</strong></td>
<td>Demographics, Education, Fanaticism, Fundamentalism, Growth, Left-wing / Right-wing, Minorities, National church, Neo-Fascism, Proselytism, Religious freedom, Schism, State religion, Theocracy, Violence (persecution, terrorism, war)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Secularism and non-religion</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atheism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criticism of religion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deconstruction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irreligion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nontheism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion and science</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secular theology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secularization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Separation of church and state</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lists</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topics (basic topics)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deification</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denominations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Founders</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mass gatherings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New religious movements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scholars</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Religion portal**
List of religions and spiritual traditions
### Religion-related topics

**Forms of belief**
- anarchism
- transtheism
- deism
- henotheism
- maltheism
- monism
- monotheism
- pantheism
- panentheism
- polytheism
- theism

**Religious practices**
- delusion
- ecstasy
- exorcism
- faith
- forgiveness
- magic
- meditation
- mysticism
- prayer
- repentance
- sacrifice
- shunning
- superstition
- veneration
- worship

**Types of religions**
- ancestor worship
- civil religion
- folk religion
- fundamentalism
- mystery religion
- New Age
- paganism
- shamanism
- spirituality
- totemism
- animism

**Attributes of some religions**
- clergy
- creed
- cult
- dogma
- orthodoxy
- priests

**Religion and society**
- Religion and social issues
- cult
- sect
- denomination
- ecclesia
- Religious freedom
- Religiosity and Intelligence
- The axial age
- Religion of Consumerism
- Women as theological figures
- Virtue

**Elements of some religious worldviews**
- Dharma
- Yuktam
- atman
- chosen people
- creation
- belief
- end of the world
- evil
- heaven
- hell
- karma
- miracles
- moksha
- nirvana
- resurrection
- revelation
- soul
- spiritual
- possession
- supernatural
- Reports of unusual religious childbirths
- angel
- animal worship
- demigod
- demon
- deva
- devil
- ekkam
- god
- goddess
- prophet
- sky
- father
- solar
dee
- spirit

**Practices frowned upon by religions**
- apostasy
- heresy
- idolatry
- sin

**Scholarly approaches to religion**
- anthropology of religion
- comparative religion
- psychology of religion
- sociology of religion

**Comparison**
- Comparing Eastern and Western religious traditions
- Arguments for and against the existence of God

**Related subjects**
- mythology
- philosophy of religion
- theology
- pseudoreligion
- Dualism (philosophy of mind)
- Idealism (philosophy)
- Vitalism

**Opposition to religion**
- religious violence
- Criticism of Religion
- agnosticism
- atheism
- secularism
- Secular Humanism
- Irreligion

**Lists**
- list of religious topics
- Major world religions
- list of religions
- list of religious populations
- list of deities
- List of people considered to be deities
- List of religion scholars
- List of largest gatherings in history
March 2006

- Forms of belief
- Religious practices
- Types of religions
- Attributes of some religions
- Religion and society
- Elements of some religious worldviews
- Practices frowned upon by religions
- Scholarly approaches to religion
- Comparison
- Related subjects
- Opposition to religion
- Lists

December 2008

- Major groups
  - Abrahamic
    - Indian
    - Iranian
    - East Asian
    - Modern
    - Ethnic/Folk
  - Ancient religions
    - Prehistoric
    - Near East
    - Indo-European
- Aspects
- Religious studies
- Politics
- Secularism and non-religion
- Lists
Challenges

- Describing the nature of evolution
- Rethinking notions of evaluation and use
- Granularity of participation and the “edit”
Conceptual models

- Taylor (1986) – information systems as processes that add value to the user experience

- Svenonius (2000) – information organization practices as specialized languages
Basic functions

- insert entries (addition)
- delete entries (subtraction)
- replace entries (substitution)
- reorder entries (i.e., alphabetization, chronological)
- formatting (i.e., capitalization, punctuation)
Value-Added lens

Taylor’s terminology

Addition
Browsing/ Access 2

Subtraction
Selectivity

Replacement:
Precision
Link /Label
Ordering

Reorder
Accuracy/ Formatting

Formatting
# Linguistic lens

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Subheading</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Addition</td>
<td>Semantic</td>
<td>Syntactic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtraction</td>
<td>Semantic</td>
<td>Syntactic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replacement: Link/Label</td>
<td>Semantic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reorder</td>
<td>Syntactic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formatting</td>
<td>Pragmatic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Major groups</td>
<td>Religion topics</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abrahamic</td>
<td>Bahá'í Faith, Christianity, Gnosticism, Islam, Judaism, Rastafari, Samaritanism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>Ayyavazhi, Buddhism, Hinduism, Jainism, Sikhism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iranian</td>
<td>Manichaeanism, Mazdakism, Yarsan, Yazidi, Zoroastrianism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Asian</td>
<td>Chinese, Confucianism, Juche, Taoism, Shinto</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern</td>
<td>Cao Dai, I-Kuan Tao, Neopaganism, Scientology, Spiritism, Tenrikyo, Unitarian Universalism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic / Folk</td>
<td>African, Afro-American, Eurasian, Indigenous Australian, Native American, Pacific, Polynesian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prehistoric</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Near East</td>
<td>Egyptian, Semitic, Mesopotamian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indo-European</td>
<td>Celtic, Germanic, Illyro-thracian, Greek, Hellenism (Gnosticism, Neoplatonism), Roman, Slavic, Vedic Hinduism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aspects</td>
<td>Apostasy / Disaffiliation, Beliefs, Conversion, Denomination, Deities, God, Meditation, Monasticism, Mysticism, Orthodoxy, Orthopraxy, Mythology, Priesthood, Ritual (liturgy, sacrifice), Spirituality, Supernatural, Symbols, Truth</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious studies</td>
<td>Anthropology, Comparison, Development, History, Origin, Philosophy, Psychology, Sociology, Theology, Theories, Timeline</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Politics</td>
<td>Demographics, Education, Fanaticism, Fundamentalism, Growth, Left-wing / Right-wing, Minorities, National church, Neo-Fascism, Proselytism, Religious freedom, Schism, State religion, Theocracy, Violence (persecution, terrorism, war)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secularism and non-religion</td>
<td>Atheism, Criticism of religion, Deconstruction, Irreligion, Nontheism, Religion and science, Secular theology, Secularization, Separation of church and state</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lists</td>
<td>Topics (basic topics), Deities, Deification, Denominations, Founders, Mass gatherings, New religious movements, Scholars</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Religion portal
List of religions and spiritual traditions
Number of participants, grouped by # of edits made
Edit granularity - simple

Revision as of 17:21, 3 June 2006 (edit)
Jeff3000 (Talk | contribs)
(adding Spirituality Studies)← Previous edit

Revision as of 02:26, 25 July 2006 (edit) (undo)
Monkeykiss (Talk | contribs)
(non-religious belief... better term, not all of them opposes religion by nature, some may choose to oppose religion, that's irreligion.)
Next edit →

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line 45:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Line 45:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="https://example.com/table.png" alt="Table" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Gross edit counts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Taylor’s terminology</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Subheading</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Addition Browsing/ Access 2</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtraction Selectivity</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replacement Precision</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reorder &amp; Formatting Ordering/ Accuracy/ Formatting</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undo Flexibility</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Next steps

- Refine analytical model to better account for multiple types of modifications in a single “edit”

- Look for patterns among edits made by repeat participants

- Better articulate the nature of disputed/contested revisions
Opportunities for LIS

- Better understand the ways people contribute to open classifications;
  - Mine these for enhancements or alternative perspectives;
  - Bridge traditional-expert and emergent-social systems;
- Extend Taylor and Svenonius models into participatory environments
References


